

# Critical Question Presentation

engl 115 H / autumn 2014 / drew university / chang



One of the best ways to explore and understand a text is through close reading. Another way to explore and understand a text—using what you have gained through reading—is through lively discussion and questioning both the text and your experience of it. You will sign-up for a critical question presentation in individually or in pairs (each person must have a speaking part). You will read the text for that day and then generate a critical, analytical question to get class discussion started for the day. Presentations are 5 to 8 minutes, may include media, and a handout is appreciated.

## What is a Critical Question?

Generating critical questions is a necessary and useful academic skill; critical questions are often the beginning of intellectual or theoretical or artistic exploration, require active and attentive reading and thinking, and can generate the beginnings of analysis, multiple perspectives on an issue, topics for research, ways to critique and understand a text, and further curiosity for the material at hand.

Your critical question for your readings presentation should develop from a close reading of one of the week's texts and your critical thinking about the text. **What questions or concerns do you want to ask of the text?** **What questions or concerns does the text ask of you?** Your critical question should be developed, dimensional, and complex that pushes beyond simple questions of theme, symbolism, personal opinion, or personal reaction. Consider the following when generating your critical question; your critical question:

- May think about the larger critical questions of our class, beyond just the course goals. What does the text reveal about our "culture" or "literature" or "reading"? How and why and what does the text respond to, reassert, or critique keywords like race, gender, class, sexuality, body, nation, citizenship, and technology.
- Asks more than, "What does \_\_\_\_\_ mean?" Critiques more than just theme, symbol, character, plot, setting. Think about the following: What is important about \_\_\_\_\_? Does \_\_\_\_\_ raise questions about representation (or how the text makes meaning), how we understand our lives and our world? Does \_\_\_\_\_ challenge or perpetuate cultural definitions, norms, traditions, ideologies?
- Begins with "How might..." or "Why..." and requires answers beyond yes or no, right or wrong, black or white, or literal or obvious. How and why and what would your answer to such a question be? In fact, critical questions often invite many different ways to answer a question and different kinds of evidence and reasoning as well.
- May focus on one section or one main idea of the text. How does the section fit the overall text? How does the main idea run through the whole text? What makes the section or idea important? What connections does it make to other texts, to the course goals?
- May be explicitly about the form, structure, language, and rhetorical or literary features of the text. What is its genre? How and why and what does it play with form? What rhetorical or literary features does it possess? How and why and what does it play with these features? How is the text answering the question, "What is important about this text?"
- Contextualizes the text in history, geography, politics, academia, and its conditions and modes of production. In other words, how and why and what is important about when the text was made, who the text was made for, where it was made, how it was made, and why it was made? What does its context tell us about our own context as we read it now?

## Insufficient Critical Questions

What does the green light at the end of the dock in F. Scott Fitzgerald's *The Great Gatsby* signify?

In *Harry Potter and the Goblet of Fire*, why does Harry choose to save both Ron and Fleur's sister? What does this say about his personality?

Because the author was nearly drowned as a child, the novel uses the metaphor of drowning as a main theme. If the author had not had this unfortunate accident, would the novel be different? Would the ending change?

Is Hamlet really crazy or just pretending to be crazy?

## Complex Critical Questions

- 1) Much has been made of the green light at the end of the dock in *The Great Gatsby*, calling it a symbol of unrequited love, the American Dream, or envy and money. Clearly *TGG* is preoccupied by the definition of and critique of class and wealth. If the green light is something unattainable, how might we think about how the novel argues about who gets to achieve the American Dream, who doesn't, and more importantly, how these logics of inclusion and exclusion fall along gendered and raced lines. Moreover, how might the American Dream be deployed to police these lines, particularly for characters like Myrtle or Meyer Wolfsheim?
- 2) Edgar Allan Poe's "The Tell-Tale Heart" troubles the definition of "mad" or "madness" through a narrator that is simultaneously, ambivalently "very, very dreadfully nervous" and "healthy" and "calm." Given that traditional and stereotypical definitions of madness center on irrationality, wild emotions, delusions, and misperceptions, how might the story's narrator resist these definitions with his rationality, calm, and keen perceptions? He says, "Now this is the point. You fancy me mad. Madmen know nothing. But you should have seen me. You should have seen how wisely I proceeded—with what caution—with what foresight—with what dissimulation I went to work!" Even the ending of the story, with the narrator overcome by his too keen perceptions, does not seem wholly uncontrolled. The narrator's confession seems more out of frustration over perceived derision than from guilt. How might reading the narrator as not mad challenge the ways madness gets defined, often mapped on to people and bodies that are deemed not "normal" or "acceptable," and how might the story itself challenge the privileging of rationality as inherently "normal" and "good"?
- 3) Although the *Harry Potter* series describes Hogwarts and the wizarding world as "genderblind," the Harry Potter novels still perpetuate certain stereotypical and prejudicial logics, particularly of gender. Close reading and analysis of the novels allow for articulation of what Giselle Liza Anatol calls the "cultural assumptions and ideological tensions" in Harry Potter. Looking specifically at the characters of Hermione, Professor McGonagall, and Mrs. Weasley, how do the novels on the one hand try to present smart, independent, and capable women characters yet on the other hand still limit and caricaturize them and subordinate them to men? How are women stereotyped in Harry Potter? By extension, how might men also be limited and stereotyped? More importantly, is it all negative or can we offer a reparative reading of gender in order to challenge genderblindness?

## Guidelines and Due Dates

- Format:** 5 to 6 minute oral presentation, individually or in pairs (each person must speak)  
light but focused research on the text or topic is encouraged  
refer to specific passages and the texts for the week  
1-page handout copied for the class is encouraged, including a bibliography of sources used
- Due:** on your sign-up date, at least twice during the semester  
please post critical question and your handout to the class blog with a subject line that includes the presentation date and topic (e.g. "9/3 PRESENTATION: Gender in *The Great Gatsby*")